

CAIR4HEALTH – Clean Air for Health

Final Dissemination Plan and Report on Raising Public Participation and Awareness

Introduction

This document updates the initial dissemination plan outlined at month 4 of the CAIR4HEALTH project and presents a structured methodology aimed at increasing awareness of the project to both the research and policy maker communities. The dissemination activities employed to target these groups will be documented and the overall strategy to disseminate and exploit project findings will be defined.

Dissemination of information was considered as a crucial component of the CAIR4HEALTH project. We used several methods and vehicles of dissemination, both formal and informal, in order to engage our target audience. A range of dissemination activities was foreseen, according to the Timeplan Table, however as we recognise the importance of day-to-day collaborative work, these activities were modified according to the progress and needs of the project and to employ other opportunities as they arose. The dissemination strategy was continuously reviewed by the project team and at PMC meetings, as well as by external stakeholders through relevant procedures. Some deviations that will be reported in the following sections have been made where necessary, in order to ensure that the dissemination actions remained relevant and achievable throughout the project duration.

1 Aims and objectives of the project

In direct response to the increased need for a community-wide procedure for reciprocal exchange of information and data relating to ambient air quality, CAIR4HEALTH was envisaged by six research institutes as a comprehensive effort aiming to *strengthen and exploit research results obtained by European and other projects related to air quality and health impact in relation to key European sustainable development action plans and strategies*. In so doing CAIR4HEALTH performed a review and horizon scanning process for key action plans including the Environment and Health Action Plan. The partners examined the research and policy-related outputs from clusters, networks, projects and expert groups including those represented by CLEAR (Cluster of European Air Quality Research) and AIRNET (A Thematic Network on Air Pollution and Health), and proposed recommendations to address the key needs of these policy initiatives. The key knowledge gaps and future needs of air quality and health research in the context of the EU Commission policy initiatives: E&HAP (Environment and Health Action Plan), ETAP (Environmental Technologies Action Plan) and TSUE (Thematic Strategy on the Urban Environment) have been identified. The project has successfully interacted with policy representatives to support the policy development and implementation of CAFE strategies and priorities for future calls of FP7. The aim was achieved through the following specific objectives:

1. *Support of the E&HAP* in its mid-term review as identified in the 4th call of the Work Programme for Global Change.

2. *Identification of the remaining knowledge gaps* in the field of air pollution and health in relation to the objectives of Environment & Health Action Plan.
3. *Identification of the technology development and deployment needs* in the area of air pollution and health impact mitigation, in the context of implementation of the Environmental Technology Action Plan.
4. *Identification of the Research & Technology (R&D) needs* to facilitate the implementation of the Thematic Strategy on the Urban Environment for improving the quality of life in urban areas in the context of air quality and health impact.
5. *Identification of research needs and knowledge gaps* in relation to the CAFE Thematic Strategy on Air Quality and its future requirements.
6. *Support of the EU Commission services* by providing advice on its R&D priorities to be implemented through mechanisms such as the forthcoming 7th Framework programme.
7. *Facilitation of the interaction, dissemination and future development* of air quality and health research programmes, clusters and networks.
8. *Enhancement of the global dissemination of air quality and health research results* for all European stakeholders.

An important achievement of CAIR4HEALTH was the analysis and dissemination of results and the preparation of future activities to enabling the Community to achieve and define its ***future RTD strategic objectives*** in particular the 7th Framework Programme. Through its dissemination activities and its deliverables, CAIR4HEALTH provides practical information on how European citizens will be affected as a result of changes in air quality and recommendations on R&D and knowledge gaps that need to be addressed in order to implement efficient strategies.

2 Disseminated messages

In order to define the messages to be disseminated, we focused on positive achievements and the benefits they will bring. This required clear agreement and careful coordination among all CAIR4HEALTH partners who, together as well as individually, acted as spokespersons or information sources for the project, in order to avoid inconsistent facts, figures, emphases and viewpoints.

As the disseminated messages were based on the project findings, the respective dissemination activities were organised according to the progress of the project. Although the recommendations for future calls on air quality and health were considered to be the main outcome of CAIR4HEALTH, the dissemination of project efforts at all stages was necessary in order to receive feedback and guidance from stakeholders.

Table 1: CAIR4HEALTH Disseminated messages.

Our Project is: an action to support EC Community environmental policies by identifying gaps and needs in the field of air quality and its impact on health, and by facilitating the interaction and development of relevant research programmes and networks.

Our Project will be disseminating the following:
1. Research needs and knowledge gaps in policy initiatives
2. Recommendations to address the key needs of the policy initiative

3. Prioritised gaps and needs in E&HAP, ETAP, TSUE and CAFÉ Thematic Strategy on Air Quality
4. Current state of the art research in urban air quality and health, research and policy-related outputs from clusters, networks etc. in the field of air quality (indoor and outdoor) and its health impacts
5. Information on air quality and health research programmes, clusters and networks
6. Results on emission reduction strategies and assessment methodologies in relation to reducing health impact and improving urban quality of life
7. Suggestions for the development of integrated assessment technologies
8. Suggestions for transferability of efficient air quality measures across different parts of Europe
9. Overview of the urban air quality research needs expected to arise in relevant areas of society, research priorities for urban air quality and health
10. Future topics regarding urban air quality and health

3 Target audiences

The target groups considered by the CAIR4HEALTH dissemination policy were determined having in mind the purposes of dissemination. The project aimed at three levels of dissemination: awareness, understanding and action/participation. The target groups for each level have been identified and are presented in the following Table. Awareness mainly involved delivering the main message of the project in relation to its aim and objectives, while understanding involved providing of more detailed information on the project purposes, methods and deliverables. At all three levels the target groups are the corresponding stakeholders, as a stakeholder can be defined as any group or individual who can affect, or be affected by the achievement of the project objectives – or can influence these objectives. Although different levels of dissemination were targeted to different audiences, all stakeholders were informed and invited to participate and intervene at project activities through the dedicated CAIR4HEALTH web portal.

As a general rule, the CAIR4HEALTH Project Management Committee strived to ensure that a number of main stakeholders would be present at several organised project meeting, in order to closely follow and comment on project progress. A list with the project partners and external participants in organised project events can be found under APPENDIX I. However, the contribution of other stakeholders was also valuable by including a wider range of target groups and obtaining a “fresh view” of the project.

Table 2: CAIR4HEALTH Target groups and corresponding dissemination levels.

	Awareness	Understanding	Involvement	Action	Support
General Public	•				
Environmental Groups	•	•	•		
Academic Institutes (key staff, students etc.)	•	•	•	•	
Local authorities and national bodies (governmental departments, agencies, ministries etc.)	•	•	•	•	
International and national non-profit organisations, NGOs	•	•	•	•	
Independent Research and Health Institutes	•	•	•	•	
Industry and Business bodies	•	•		•	
EU legislative and research bodies (relevant EC DGs, EEA etc.)	•	•	•	•	•
Relevant projects	•	•	•		
Relevant networks and clusters	•	•	•		
Project partners	•	•	•	•	•
Funding bodies	•		•		•
Advisory Group	•	•	•		
Media (journal publishers etc.)	•		•		•

4 Benefits to end users

The benefit to end users was agreed by the Project Management Committee to offer a potential solution to the particular problem of each stakeholder. Thus, the stakeholder needs and problems were firstly identified and a relevant solution was sought within the project deliverables and milestones. The engagement of users was an early priority of CAIR4HEALTH and was undertaken in an early consultation exercise to establish their needs and wants (WP3).

Table 3: Issues/problems that CAIR4HEALTH will help to overcome and which target audiences these will apply to.

Issue/Problem	Target Audience/Group
Identify gaps and needs in EU policies	DG Environment
Identify gaps and needs in relation to the CAFÉ Thematic Strategy on Air Quality	DG Environment, CAFÉ steering committee
Weak synergy between air quality and health stakeholders	Academic Institutes, Independent Science Centres, Non-profit health and air quality organizations, Industry and Business Bodies, Authorities
Insufficient exchange of information between relevant projects, clusters, networks	Academic Institutes, relevant projects, clusters, networks
Review of the E&HAP as part of the 4 th Global Change call	DG Environment
Health impacts due to poor urban air quality in Europe	General public, media, legislation bodies and EU/national authorities

5 Dissemination methods/activities

The dissemination strategy that was followed in CAIR4HEALTH ensured that the appropriate and most effective methods of dissemination and communication was used for each stakeholder group, considering the special characteristics and needs. The following approaches listed in Table 4 were employed for different target audiences.

Table 4: Appropriate dissemination methods for CAIR4HEALTH target groups.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mailing lists (brochures, publicity leaflets) <p>The contacts were encouraged to disseminate copies more widely within their own institution/organization. Units/organizations were approached that were willing to distribute this information material on behalf of the project.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • E-mail, e-mail lists
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Newsletters
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports (made available in the web portal)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Web portal
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Workshops, seminars
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Conferences
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Networking (Panels, forums and networks) <p>Information technologies provide a huge opportunity for various organisations working in the same field to utilise their information sources. This can take place on a mutual basis of information, knowledge, ideas and expertise exchange, to the extent that the organisations themselves deem appropriate. These new networking opportunities can at their best lead to more effective use of the information load.</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meetings
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One-to-one (telephone or personal interview)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Papers in journals, books

- Flyers and posters

Various leaflets and brochures were prepared on various specific topics. The distribution of these was made as wide as possible during relevant events, such as conferences, workshops.

- Learning and teaching modules (also on-line modules)
- Questionnaire

One of the most important dissemination activities was the development and population of a dedicated web portal for the project in March 2007 by AUTH partners. The web portal can be found at www.cair4health.eu and will be maintained for three more years after the completion of the project. The web site contains basic information on the aims, objectives and structure of the project, as well as relevant links and a members' area for project partners. Working documents for internal communication purposes were distributed to all project partners through this members' area which is password protected. An account to access this protected area has been administered to experts who were invited to participate in project workshops. Through the home page the visitor is notified about future events of the project and workshop presentations and minutes can also be accessed by the general public. After submission of the project deliverables to the European Committee, the final deliverables will also be posted at the web portal.

A series of three electronic newsletters were also produced by AUTH partners and distributed to the general public through the project web portal and also by personal e-mail to selected stakeholders. The newsletter issues included a brief presentation of the project and the partners, main milestones at each stage of the project, main outcomes from project meetings and workshops and announcements of future events organised by the CAIR4HEALTH Project Management Committee but also of external events relevant to the scope of the project. It was envisaged that a newsletter issue would be produced every six months, however throughout the progress of the project all partners agreed that a newsletter would only be a valuable dissemination activity if its content was of considerable quantity and contained new information. Therefore, three instead of four electronic newsletter issues were produced within the total duration of the project.

In order to identify the main research needs on air quality and health according to main stakeholders, all partners were responsible for approaching a number of pre-defined stakeholders in order to collect relevant information. The leaders of this activity were the partners from TNO. A questionnaire and a protocol (APPENDIX II) were structured, including the questions that would be used by the partners in their contacts with stakeholders, in order to guide the discussion and proceed in a harmonised approach. This activity had a two-fold aim, to raise awareness of the project and its aims and collect the views of stakeholders in order to present them in a coherent overview. The stakeholders were contacted via e-mail, phone and personal interviews.

Additional means were also used when possible in order to raise awareness of the project. For example, several copies of the electronic newsletter were released during scientific events such as the SAFE conference in Istanbul on the 9th and 10th of January 2008.

6 Action Plan

2007		
CAIR4HEALTH Kick-off Meeting	Feb 07	✓
CAIR4HEALTH web portal (members area) active	March 07	✓
Establish contact with members for External Experts (EE)	April 07	✓
Prepare announcement leaflets for the Ispra Meeting	May 07	✓
1 st CAIR4HEALTH PMC and EE Meeting in Ispra	May 07	✓
Report on Communication and Dissemination Strategy	May 07	✓
Project Partner Teleconference	June 07	✓
Establish contacts with experts, projects, industry, authorities to provide their views on research needs/gaps	July 07	✓
1 st CAIR4HEALTH email newsletter	Aug 07	✓
Report on future topics regarding urban air quality and health for FP7	Oct 07	✓
Set up links with relevant projects and networks	Nov 07	✓
2 nd CAIR4HEALTH PMC Meeting in Brussels	Dec 07	✓
1 st CAIR4HEALTH AG Workshop in Brussels	Dec 07	✓
1 st Periodic Report including Management report	Dec 07	✓
1 st Management Report	Dec 07	✓

2008		
Report on current state of the art research in urban air quality and health	Jan 08	✓
CAIR4HEALTH Annual progress Report	Jan 08	✓
2 nd CAIR4HEALTH email newsletter	Feb 08	✓
2 nd CAIR4HEALTH Workshop	June 08	✓
Report on Research priorities for urban air quality and health	Aug 08	✓
3 rd CAIR4HEALTH email newsletter	Sept 08	✓
Report on the implications for research priorities of E&HAP, TSUE and ETAP	Oct 08	✓
Report on the implications for CAFÉ in relation to future challenges in urban air quality and health	Dec 08	✓

2009		
3 rd CAIR4HEALTH Workshop	Jan 09	✓
Final PMC meeting	Jan 09	✓
2 nd Periodic Activity Report	Feb 09	✓
2 nd Management Report	Feb 09	✓
2 nd Report on the future topics regarding urban air quality and health for FP7	Feb 09	✓
Final dissemination plan and report on raising public participation and awareness	Feb 09	✓

The dissemination and communication activities of the project have been scheduled on the basis of the planned deliverables, thus they were particularly useful in terms of discussing results, difficulties and future steps. The timing of the meetings also ensured that the produced results and compiled knowledge would be sufficient to

provide a good background for a fruitful discussion with external experts. On this basis, some deviations from the time-table of the planned activities occurred, to ensure maximum benefit of the dissemination activities. The Final Workshop of CAIR4HEALTH was rescheduled from the 3rd of December 2008 to the 19th of January 2009, as the original date coincided with another meeting thus hindering the attendance of external experts. In order to ensure maximum participation and the presence of important stakeholders, it was agreed that the Final Workshop would take place back-to-back with the CONCAWE meeting on the 19th of January 2009 in Brussels. The objectives of the CONCAWE association are very relevant to the scope of CAIR4HEALTH, as they focus on acquiring and producing scientific knowledge regarding the impact of pollution due to industrial activities on human health. The results are then communicated to scientific experts and the general public, but also to policy makers who can then make more informed decisions regarding environmental management issues and promotion of EU financed calls to respond to important research needs in this field. Based on this link and common underlying scope of the two efforts, the organisation of a combined event to present the outcomes from CAIR4HEALTH and latest CONCAWE research activities was considered particularly beneficial to maximise the impact of the recommendations for future FP7 calls, resulting from the research needs that have emerged.

8 Evaluation and Criteria for Success

It was recognised by the Project Committee at the early stages of the project that an effective dissemination strategy should reflect the changing needs of its participants and stakeholders. Therefore, the dissemination plan was frequently reviewed on the basis of both internal – within project partners - and external – mainly through the Advisory Group and involved stakeholders - evaluation procedures. Within this frame all the involved stakeholders were able to offer suggestions for improvement and comments on the usefulness of each method used through the web portal and during CAIR4HEALTH organised events. As a result, the external experts who participated in the Final Workshop of the project agreed that the methodology that was followed by the project partners was successful in including and communicating with all relevant stakeholders to achieve the objectives of CAIR4HEALTH.

Regarding publishable results of CAIR4HEALTH, all the reports produced as deliverables from the project will be publicly available through the web portal, after they have been approved by the EC. The results of the project highlighted the main knowledge gaps and research needs in the field of air quality and health and were used by the EC for formulating FP7 calls to respond to these needs.

APPENDIX I – Partners and selected external experts participating at project events

Kick-Off Meeting, 1-2 February 2007, Brussels

Participants:

Ranjeet Sokhi (UH-CAIR)
Jaakko Kukkonen (FMI)
Dick van den Hout (TNO)
Denis Sarigiannis (JRC)
Nicolas Moussiopoulos (AUTH)
Bert Brunekreef (IRAS-UU)

CAIR4HEALTH meeting of External Experts, 25 May 2007, JRC ISPRA

External Experts present:

Peter Rombout (Independent)
Aaron Cohen (HEI, USA)
Alena Bartonova (NILU, Norway)
Peter Pärt (JRC, International)
Andreas Skouloudis (JRC, International)
Jan Urbanus (CONCAWE, Belgium)
Martin Williams (DEFRA, UK)

Project partners present:

Ranjeet Sokhi (UH-CAIR)
Dick van den Hout (TNO)
Jaakko Kukkonen (FMI)
Mia Pohjola (FMI)
Bert Brunekreef (IRAS-UU)
Hanna Boogard (IRAS-UU)
Lia Fragkou (AUTH)
Denis Sarigiannis (JRC)
Dimitrios Kotzias (JRC)
Nicolina Mucci (JRC)
Ravindra Ravindra (UH)

CAIR4HEALTH Teleconference, Tuesday 19 June 2007

Participants:

Lia Fragkou (AUTH)
Denis Sarrigianis (JRC)
Jaakko Kukkonen (FMI)
Mia Pohjola (FMI)
Dick van den Hout (TNO)
Ranjeet Sokhi (UH)
Ravindra Khaiwal (UH)
Bert Brunekreef (UU)
Hanna Boogaard (UU)

CAIR4HEALTH meeting of External Experts, 14 December 2007, Brussels

External Experts present:

Claus Bruning (DG Research)
Andrej Kobe (EC DG Env)
Michal Krzyzanowski (WHO, Bonn)
Robert Sausen (DLR, Coordinator of
QUANTIFY)

Project partners present:

Hanna Boogard (RUUTR-FVM)
Bert Brunekreef (RUUTR-FVM)
Lia Fragkou (AUTH)
Mtinkeni Gondwe (TNO)
Ravindra Khaiwal (UH)
Jaakko Kukkonen (FMI)
Jane Newbold (UH)
Denis Sarigiannis (JRC)
Ranjeet S Sokhi (UH)
Dick van den Hout (TNO)

CAIR4HEALTH Workshop, June 19 2008, Brussels

External Experts present:

Fintan Hurley (IOM, UK)
Johannes Hendricks
Martin Williams (DEFRA, UK)
Andrej Kobe (EC DG Env)
Claus Bruning (DG Research)
Tuomo Karjalainen
Peter Rombout (Independent)

Project partners present:

Ranjeet Sokhi (UH)
Jane Newbold (UH)
Jaakko Kukkonen (FMI)
Mia Pohjola (FMI)
Bert Brunekreef (RUUTR-FVM)
Dick van den Hout (TNO)
Mtinkheni Gondwe (TNO)
Nicolas Moussiopoulos (AUTH)
Lia Fragkou (AUTH)
Denis Sarigiannis (JRC)

Final CAIR4HEALTH Workshop, January 19 2009, Brussels

External Experts present:

Alena Bartonova (NILU, Norway)
Andrej Kobe (EC DG Env)
Christian Farrar-Hockley
Fintan Hurley (IOM, UK)
Valentin Foltescu

Project partners present:

Bert Brunekreef (RUUTR-FVM)
Lia Fragkou (AUTH)
Ravindra Khaiwal (UH)
Jaakko Kukkonen (FMI)
Jane Newbold (UH)
Denis Sarigiannis (JRC)
Ranjeet S Sokhi (UH)
Dick van den Hout (TNO)

APPENDIX II– Guidance and template for stakeholder interviews

Guidance and template for CAIR4HEALTH stakeholder interviews

Draft

Dick van den Hout, 4 May 2007

The interview consists of two parts.

Part I: Introduction to the interview and general background

The interviewer should explain the purpose of CAIR4HEALTH and the purpose and structure of the interview. The purpose of the interview is to identify the research needs of the stakeholders group represented by the interviewee in the field of air quality and health.

The views expressed by the interviewee will be regarded as a personal opinion, not as an official view of the organisation that the interviewee is affiliated to.

Part II: Questions and answers

The interviewer should proceed with the questions of the template. If needed, the interview may deviate from the template; the interview report however should follow the template, in order to allow synthesis with interviews with other stakeholders.

TEMPLATE: QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

Interviewer: ...; date of interview: ...

Interview mode: face-to-face / telephone / email

Question 1. *Name etc*

Name	
Affiliation	
Address	
Country	
Telephone	
Email	
Function	

Question 2. To which *stakeholder group* do you belong (tick one or more)?

<i>Type of use</i>	<i>Tick</i>
Developing policy/legislation related to AQ&H	
Applying policy/legislation related to AQ&H	
Addressing stakeholder interests (Industry, NGO, ...)	
Providing public information on E&H	
Medical practice	
Consulting	
Developing risk assessment / decision support	
Research	
Other (please specify):	
...	

Question 3. *Broad comments* on priorities, needs and concerns related to AQ&H, if any.

...

Question 4. What is the *role of research* in air quality and health in organisations in your stakeholder group?

...

Question 5. Do you have sufficient *access to research findings*? If not, do you have *suggestions* for improving this?

...

Question 6. [This is the key question of the interview!] What are *research needs* of your stakeholder group? If possible, indicate importance per need.

Useful categories are:

- Air pollution in general
- Emission sources
- Pollutants
- Monitoring and measurement
- Health impacts
- Policy and management
- Tools

...

Question 7. Can you suggest *publications* or other documentation that we can use to investigate research needs of stakeholders?

...

Question 8. Do you have other *issues, questions, concerns* related to research in air quality and health?

...

Question 9. Are you interested in *maintaining contact* with CAIR4HEALTH?

<i>Mode of contact</i>	<i>Tick</i>
No further contact	
On Emailing List	
Invited to workshops and meetings	
Available for commenting results	
Contribute to the work to be done. If yes, please specify any preference:	
...	

Question 10. Would you like to suggest *other colleagues or contacts* whom you think could be approach by CAIR4HEALTH?

<i>Name</i>	<i>Organisation</i>	<i>Contact details</i>
Add rows when needed		

Question 12. *Any other comments*

...